Overview of Planning and Financing Sustainable Low-Carbon Urban Transport

—Transcript of a webinar offered by the Clean Energy Solutions Center on 17 September 2013—
For more information, see the clean energy policy trainings offered by the Solutions Center.

Webinar Panelists

Lefevre Benoit Director of the Transport and Climate Program EMBARQ, Senior Associate Transport in Climate CVP, World Resources Institute

This Transcript Because this transcript was created using transcription software, the content it contains might not represent precisely the audio content of the webinar. If you have questions about the content of the transcript, please contact us or refer to the actual webinar recording.

Sean Esterly Hello and welcome to today's webinar hosted by the Clean Energy Solution Center. We are very fortunate to have Dr. Benoit Lefevre speaking on Planning and Financing of Sustainable Low-Carbon Urban Transport. One important note of mention before we begin our presentation is that the Clean Energy Solution Center does not endorse or recommend specific products or services. Information providing this webinar is featured in the Solutions Centers Resource Library as one of many best practices resources review and selected by technical experts. And before we begin, I'll quickly go over some of the webinar features for today. For audio, you have two options that you can use. You may either listen to your computer or over your telephone. If you choose to listen to your computer, please select the mic and speaker's option in the AudioPaint. By doing so, we will eliminate the possibility of feedback and echo and if you select the telephone option, the box on the right side will display your telephone number. In AudioPaint, you should use the dial in. Panelist we ask that you please mute your audio devices while you're not presenting. If anyone needs technical or has technical difficulties with the webinar, you may contact the gotowebinar-help.@aaa2593826. If you'd like to ask a question during the webinar, which we encourage, we ask that you use the question pane where you may type in your question and they'll be sent to the panelist. If you're having difficulty viewing the materials through the webinar portal, you will find PDF copies of the presentation at cleanenergysolutions.org/training and then you may follow along as our speakers present. Also, in the audio recording in the presentations will be posted to the Solution Center training page within a few weeks of this webinar. Now we have a terrific agenda prepared for you that is focused on key issues to consider when designing a financial strategy for sustainable transport. Now before our speakers begin their presentations I'd like to provide a short informative overview of the Clean Energy Solution Center Initiative and the Low-Emission Development Strategy Global Partnership. Phone presentations will have a question and answer session and then wrap up with the discussion and closing remarks. This slide provides a bit of background in terms of how the Solution Center came to be. The Solution Center is Initiative of the Clean Energy

Ministerial and is supported through our partnership with you and the Energy. It will be launched in April of 2011 as primarily lead by Australia, the United States, and other CEM partners. Outcomes in this unique partnership includes support of developing countries in enhancement of resource as a policy relating their energy access, the no cost expert policy assistance, and peer-to-peer learning and training tools such as this webinar. Other solution center has four primary goals. It serves as a clearinghouse of clean energy policy resources. It also serves to share policy best practices, data, and analysis tools specific to Clean Energy Policy and Programs. The tools in the center deliver dynamic services at enabled expert assistance, learning, and peer-to-peer sharing of experiences and lastly the Intercultural dialogue on emerging policy issue and innovation around the globe. Now the primary audience is the Energy Policy makers and analysts from governments and technical organizations in all countries but we also strive being engaged with the private sector NGOs with civil society. A marked key feature that the Pollution Center provides is the expert policy assistance. It's known as asking expert is a valuable service offered through the solution center with established broad team of over 30 experts from around the globe where available to provide remote policy advice and analysis to countries at no cost. So in the area of transport, we are very pleased to 10 years senior project leader at the US National Renewable Energy Laboratory serving as an expert. If you have any for policy assistance and clean transportation or any other clean energy sector, we encourage you to use this useful service. Again, this assistance is provided free of charge. To request assistance, you may submit your request by registering through our, Asking the Expert feature at cleanenergysolutions.org/expert. We also invite you to spread the words of this service to build it in your networks in the organizations. We encourage you to explore and take advantage of the Solution Center Resources and Services including extra policy assistance, a standard newsletter and also participate in more webinars like this. Now I'd like to just give a quick overview on the Low-Emission Development Strategies. The Low-Emission Development Strategies Global Partnership is a partnership of more than 100 countries and international programs, enhances coronation, information exchange in cooperation to advance climate resilient Low-Emission Growth. And now I'd like to provide a brief introduction of our panelist Dr. Benoit Lefevre, director of the Transport and Climate Program EMBARQ, senior associate transport in Climate CVP at the World Resources Institute. Dr. Benoit will discuss two issues to consider when designing a financial strategy for sustainable transport and with that, I'd like to welcome Benoit.

Dr. Benoit Lefevre   Okay so, good evening and good morning everybody. I hope that you can hear me very well. So I'm Benoit Lefevre. I'm working at the World Resource Institute and now I will make a presentation on Overview of Planning and Financing Sustainable Low Carbon Urban Transport. So the objective of this presentation is to give an overview of how to plan, how to finance, how to find sustainable low-carbon urban transport and how to link these two key issues, which are planning and financing. I will not go

in depth in each of those topics. I will not have enough time for that but I will arise. I'll try to open many doors and give you a good overview and key element to frame a discussion and to frame what you can do instead and I hope that we will have a great discussion after that.

So next slide please.

So as you already just presented, this webinar is a part of the Low-Emission Development Strategy LEDS activities. WRI EMBARQ in partnership with NREL is leading some transport works frame of the Low-Emission Development Strategy. Mainly in this transport works training, what we are doing is first, to produce and diffuse tools, knowledge, in order to support as a policy making and advising decision. Second is to do a continuous support through peer-to-peer learning, expert training, workshop and I would like to highlight the workshop that we will have this 30 of September so within very few weeks in Manila and proceedings are LEDS Workshop from the Asian Regional Platform and the last activity that we are doing and the urban transport work stream is on financial advice. So we also have a lot of support, peer-to-peer learning, expert advice and connecting people around the financial issue of Low-Emission Transport Planning.

Next slide please.

So as the first pointer we like to make today is that transport is the key part of sustainable and Low-Carbon Development Strategy and this is true locally, nationally, and globally.

Next slide please.

So when you look at transport, when you try to imagine what is transport and especially urban transport, this is a situation that comes in mind, the majority of all city transport is congestion. This is a photo taken in United Kingdom.

Next slide please.

This is a photo in Turkey, same situation.

Next slide.

And this is a photo in Thailand, same situation, same trouble, [inaudible] [00:09:50] congested, pollution, et cetera.

Next slide please.

So, and this situation as a huge impact on each level, huge impact of course as a global level, huge impact as a national and local level, and huge impact in all individual life, day to day life for example taken to the case of Bangkok, we see the congestion as a cost, a huge cost in term of

percentage of GDP lost each year. So it's 2.5% of GDP lost just because of the time that people spent in congestion. In term of accidents more than 2% in terms of air pollution, local air pollution, again it's 2.5%. So this is a huge, huge scratch nationally and locally.

Next slide please.

And of the global level, we know that transport is already one of the most important sources of GHG Emission of very important sources of energy conception and this is growing the fastest. So this is really a merchant agenda and a long term commitment.

Next slide please.

The key idea that I will like to share here is that often for the transport sector is a global agenda, global issue and the national and local agenda, national and local interest work together. There is synergy. You should take for example this graft where you have a seal to emission into erect and as a local emission is the X axis. You see there is a huge correlation. This is an Indian city so there's a huge correlation between the global pollution and the local pollution. So at the end, no matter if you address this issue through global perspective or through local national perspective, you do both at the same time.

Next slide.

Another example is that we are assessing, we are evaluating that we are spending worldwide most at 300 billion US dollar per year on fuel subsidies. Of course fuel subsidies are key security net for the first part of the world population but just if we imagine that we can find a way to keep this security net but at the same reduce those fuel subsidies, this 300 billion US dollar on fuel subsidy represent 6% of global GHG Emission. So if we cut this 300 billion in one day reduce this 6% global GHG Emission.

Next slide please.

So my second point is that first to plan Low-Carbon Transport System and implement relevance policy and project and program, we need to enter in the complex city of all cities. So what I would like to present right now is that we need to enter into complexity of the interaction between transport and learn use between the transport market and the rare state in housing markets but the good news and that's my second subpoint of this second point is that we have the relevant instrument to do it. So we have the relevant existing instrument to enter in this complexity and to find a way to plan and implement Low-Carbon Transport.

Next slide.

But before re-entering that, I just would like to—that we are more careful with quick and easy simplification that we often read and often read in newspaper for example. That is a common understanding that when the local GDP is growing, when people get worse, the rate of motorization will increase, the use of car will increase and so certainly the energy conception will increase and the same idea is that when worse, the GDP is increasing to offer in term of transportation services and public transportation [inaudible] [00:14:40] will increase and in fact when we look worldwide at data base, it's just not through. There is no link, no phone correlation between any increase of GDP and to increase in term of motorization rates, car use and energy consumption and just to give you a simple example, the two city Miami and Copenhagen. Two cities that have the same population, the same level of population that are both well see rich in a very rich environment to a rich country. In Copenhagen, more than 60% of trips are made via public transport and 20% via bike so more around 80% of the trips are done by public transport and non-motorized transports. In Miami, same situation, complete inverse and reverse transport situation. We don't even count the people biking or working because every day most are 99% of people of the street are done through private vehicles. So the key take away of that is that transport energy consumption and GHG Emission cannot be analyzed only through average that—and not taking into account special dimension of city and special interaction of transport and land use especially and that's what I would like to develop a bit more now.

Next slide please.

So, first level of analysis or first way to enter in this complexity is to take some average density of the city and the correlation to relation between those average densities of different city around the world and level of energy conception for transport. If you look at this perhaps you see a strong group relation between the two parameters but one more interesting thing from me, so this has been produced by Newman and Kenworthy, two Australian more than 10 years ago so it's really well known now and that I'd like to take one seat on this. So first is there is a huge correlation between density and energy conception. The second is you take for example Los Angeles on the left top corner and Sydney or Chicago and Sydney and we see that you have the same density but complete different level of energy conception. Similar exercise, if you take London and Tokyo, you will have the same energy conception. So this time it's horizontal that will have the same energy conception but with complicated difference than the population density. So it's just to say that there is room for this issue. There is room for policy making that really this is something that we can change and decide and abduct. There is no vitality in that and so it's really a matter of policy making and financing to final investors. How to do that?

Next slide please.

So, how to understand those relations? In fact we are using what we call the human structure and the human structure it's a 2:6. It is a special distribution of two elements, first of subtree pattern and second population. It's a special distribution of population. So here you have a very simplified representation of four different tree pattern, the monocentric model, the polycentric model, and the polycentric model with random movement version and intermediate monopoly-centric model. So this is just a simplified representation that they're useful to analyze and understand how a transport system is working in the city and so how we can intervene on this.

Next slide please.

So the second aspect of this urban structure is the special distribution of population. So this is the representation of residence of different city, Paris, Jakarta, Moscow, Shanghai, Belgium and this is very visual. So here I just would like to say two things first. We can do that kind of craft that are very easy and useful to analyze and to work on right those things to own the computer we have, et cetera and it's also very useful to communicate and to make very easy to understand an idea or an issue or complexity to a group of stockholders that are coming with different background and different interest. It's very easy to understand where, I don't know, when you are comparing Berlin and Paris that the situation is clearly not the same. So the solution certainly will not be the same or when you're comparing Moscow and Berlin on New York and Bangkok and Shanghai. Okay.

So next slide please.

So in fact, again, thanks to this way of framing each one and understanding and framing the discussion. We can start to have some simplified model to discuss this interaction between transport and land use. So for example when we try to understand the correlation between subdensity and the tree patterns, so for example if we have a more polycentric tree pattern with a very low density, we know that we can start to discuss what type of the transport are much more relevant and so what type of intervention we need to have in order to improve the transport system. Of course, in a very dominantly polycentric system with a very, very low density like let's say Atlanta, of course public transport and Segway will not be the key solution at first and perhaps we need to concentrate on how to improve the few deficiency of your vehicles or we can improve some cashiering, et cetera and to Rivas and Shanghai where you have a very identity who is a very dominantly monocentric so people coming from the side belts going to the centers. It's much more relevant to work on public transport and try to improve solution around this so I'm really focusing on few deficiency of cost. So with that kind of very easy and very graphic, very visual way of communicating and understanding, we can start to have a better understanding and so better policy making and to support the decision.

Next slide please.

So, what can we do? Do we have to come back to bicycle only in all time? How can we find a way?

Next slide please.

So I like to take this example. This is the same graft done by Newman and Kenworthy with—so it's CO_2 emission this time. It's not energy consumption but it's CO_2 emission and you have the different cities under X axis. So and you have so on to the left side throughout the situation of Atlanta, onto right side throughout the situation of Barcelona. Again, two cities with the same wells, same level of population but completely different size and completely different model chair, et cetera and completely different level of CO_2 Emission. So again this is to say that there is room for action. This is not – there is no fatality here.

Next slide please.

So what we can do, it's not very magical. It's mainly to integrate some occurrence policy that we have and there's a land use policy and a transport policy. So it's really to take into a pincer to Urban Transport Emission by reducing formability improving to accessibility but reducing some need of moving and increasing the offer of sustainable Low-Carbon Transport. So increasing solution to services and how to do that is by integrating land use policy and transport policy using traditional but packaging those traditional instrument and policy.

Next slide please.

In just to say because this is not theoretical. This is not an academic exercise we are doing here. This is I imagine that that of you know this person on the top right corner. So it's Jaime Lerner, former mayor of the City of Curitiba in Brazil and in the 70s he started to have a very simple idea. Let's integrate the transport and the land use, my master plan and my transport plan and I'm going to invest evenly in transport note to bus rapid transits that you can see in red but I will link this huge investment that I will be able to do just once. I will leave this investment with some real estates and housing policy targeting trying to friends on market, trying to put some tax system, some regulation that can complement and take as much as possible opportunity level adjustment just as possible to opportunity of this huge investment use of transport system itself. So a designer plan where there is much more density along the corner mixing the use of the slant with residency and shop and office, et cetera.

Next slide please.

And this is a resort. This is a resort so it's market's, private sticker bills, private actor reacted positively to this plan, reacted positively in term of yes, say you found the interest in investing office residency along at the

corridor and that was a good, so a very efficient way to influence the evolutions of dynamic of urban structure.

Next slide please.

So my second plan again is that we have tools. We have tools to do that to exist. We don't need to help—we don't need to wait for some next generation of tools and I would like to take quickly, sorry for that, but I will have to take quickly two example. One is on tools that help to make the right policy, the right decision and shape up this decision and in fact tools that help to have the right discussion and then I would like to take the example of tools that help to implement this decision and so to design a strategy to implement this policy decision.

Next slide please.

So tools to make to help the discussion and decision are the transport and land use model. So it exist—there is quite—there are more than 20 transport land use integrated model around the world. This one is Trunews. It's an example in Bangalore in India. Why I used Trunews is because it's a very simple one, easy to use. It's a free access. You can download Trunews. You can download tutorial. You can download tutorial example. You can download a guide for user, et cetera and this is a one that has been applied or in different context in different country in the United States, in Venezuela, Columbia, Chile, in Africa, in India, in Europe, in France, Belgium, et cetera, Brazil, so in many, many countries. It's used by many consulting firms. It's used by the World Bank. It's used by the United States in an environmental agency. So it's a very basic idea. You have—so this model allows you to represent your city, to represent the real estate and housing markets and to represent your transport system. On the left side, you have a tree of scenario while you can test solution and you can test those solutions at different level. You can test the solution in term of economic efficiency, in term of financial sustainability, in term of what are consequences in land consumption in the evolution of real estate prices, et cetera and accessibility, et cetera and in term of energy conception and CO_2 emission.

Next slide please.

So this is just to show you quickly that that can work at very, very different level. This is a very detailed focus on small streets networks.

Next slide please.

So I already discussed two examples how it was—no just one example because we do not have time to present. That's one example of how it has been used in real. In real, the mayor wanted to address the poor spots of the population and you wanted to improve the accessibility of this population leaving in those lands, in those favelas and to improve their access to the job market and to job location and you wanted to test

different option and used Trunews to test who else are cost-efficient to more cost efficient solution and because he knew that it couldn't build a new subway. It couldn't—it didn't have the money. It was not relevant to just build again a new highway because in present I know that very well that quite quickly those highways get just congested and thanks to Trunews he was able to test another solution which is a land bank. So he started to buy land not in the close center but not in downtown but in the first periphery and he decided to visited to offer some option to this poor population to settle in this first periphery and to have a better access to the job market and that's how we designed this policy and this is real and intended to have one of the only transport master plan I know that the most biggest investment is not in transport. It's not a transport investment per se but it's on land and on a real estate investment.

Next slide please.

So, now my second example tools to implement, how to implement a taken decision, how to design a strategy to implement those decision.

Next slide please.

So this is something we design for New York. This is a map of stock holders. So the idea here is to put on the map all stock holders and to represent the connection between those stock holders and who has the influence on who, who has the capacity to hide and to do what and it can be by rules, it can be by law, it can be because it's a financial capacity to act. It can be because it's a reputation capacity to act et cetera and that helped Sir Mayor Bloomberg to design one of its policies.

Next slide please.

So for this one we did the same exercise in Bogota and in order to analyze the whole, you can influence the debate at that time between subway and a bus rapid transit of what was the most efficient strategy to influence this debate and to implement the policy, thanks to that. So the exercise was to understand who has a power to influence to policy making and how to process a decision making process works.

Next slide please.

The last example is what we call the wedge analysis. So this wedge analysis is what we use in London. So it's basically what you have. The top line is a business as usual scenario. The second line is to target redemption. So London has a huge, a very ambitious target to reduce CO_2 emission and say did a wedge analysis to understand, okay, who is responsible to do what, who has the capacity to achieve what part of this target and they ended to say that directly to Mayor as not so much capacity to act but as the Mayor of London, he can raise its flag. He can go to the media. He can ask national government to do. It can go to school and educate children. It can do an advertising campaign to change their views,

et cetera. So it's also a way to analyze and design a strategy to implement a policy that's also a way to communicate this strategy and this policy.

Next slide please.

So my subpoint and my final point for this presentation is that is on the link between financing and planning, and how to access and use climate fines. So the main point here is that yes there is money to do this, to design and implement and plan and implement those Low-Carbon Sustainable Transport Policy Transport Project and Program. There is funding available to do that but it's not throughout so we need to use this funding adequately. We need to use it in a very efficient way in order to leverage more investments.

Next slide please.

So why, this is a subcurrent investment globally each year, one trillion is invested into transport sector. Half of this one trillion come from domestic finance and the maturity of this one trillion is private finance, a huge maturity. So and as you see, the climate finance is little. Of course it is really—it is a very growing one but it's still little.

Next slide please.

And the second aspect of this current reality is that the main part of this one trillion invested each year globally into transport sectors go to what we can call non-sustainable transport or is a current business as usual transport, also carbon intensive transport system. So there is huge risk of carbon looking. There is technology pass dependency here and this is really urgent and a long term commitment to shift.

Next slide please.

So the idea is that carbon finance is not a silver bullet that need to be used as an incentive.

Next slide please.

And as I was telling you before presenting before, there is quite a lot of different offense and sometime it appeared to be quite complicated to access to this offense that there is also a growing literature accessible for decision makers, et cetera that are available now and that can support government on accessing this climate finance and this is also something that in LED and particularly in LEDS transport work stream we are really ready to do. So I will not enter into detail of this table. It's just to show you of its type of [inaudible] [00:38:12] amount of available funding here.

Next slide please.

So given this big picture, I think that there is tree key takeaway, tree key steps. First is to access this kind of finance. Second is to combine this climate finance with also financial sources and sales to combine these financial sources in order to leverage more investment and especially from the private sectors in order to shift these talents from business social transport to Sustainable Low-Carbon Transports.

Next slide please.

And to do that we need to design financial strategy. We need to have a clear stable long term perspective, long term financial strategy blending, merging, this size, a lot of different way to do it. This is of course really an example here. So there's a lot of different way to do it and often the most efficient way needed to be adopted locally given some national and local context but this is a key issue and next slide please.

And last is we also – my last point is also to say that we need to be ready to access this money and there is different element to be ready to access this money and we are currently finalizing a publication on that and we will be very happy to share that in the coming weeks. So we identified seven component of what does it mean to be ready to access climate finance and it's essentially having the financial strategy walking on institutional arrangement ensuring that environment enable more investments. Be sure that we can add some data, [inaudible] [00:40:33] data and then having a clear view and a clear assessment of co-benefits then to attract some private sector and deal an attractive fine work and its financial instrument and policy here and so being able to calculate the emission.

Next slide please.

So this is more as the same thing like the five most important redness action, is to attract private market to focus on institutional capacity to plan early an upstream, to develop a financial strategy and to gather good data.

Next slide please.

So this is my last slide. So the key take away I would like to leave you tonight or today is that what part is the key part of sustainable and Low-Carbon Development Strategy that Low-Carbon Transport Planning and Financing is complex but we have the tools to do that? We have to untie the complexity of all cities but we have the tools to do that and we have—and there is funding and financial sources ready to support this Low-Carbon Transport Planning and implementing. So it's and—but the key thing is that we need to use this climate finance in order to shift the current financial flow because climate finance will never be a silver bullet. It needs to be used efficiently.

Next slide.

	So thank you I will stop here and I will welcome your question, remark, comments. You have here my email address. So do not hesitate to enter in contact. I will be very happy to follow-up with you after that and you have also the LEDS Global Partnership website where you will find this presentation, this webinar and you will find also the link to Transport Work Stream Tool Kit where a lot of information, tools, database, et cetera are available. Thanks a lot.
Female Speaker 1	Thank you Benoit. Sean, are you there? Ready to take the questions?
Sean	Yup, yes I am, yeah.
Female Speaker 1	Great. Okay. Go on.
Sean	Benoit thank you very much for the presentation. I just want to remind the audience that we can submit questions through the question pane in the GoToWebinar. The first question from the audience tonight is could you please describe the different climate finance instruments that are available for Urban Transport Projects in developing countries?
Dr. Benoit Lefevre	How do you want me to present. Do I answer question by question or?
Sean	Yeah.
Dr. Benoit Lefevre	Okay.
Sean	Yeah.
Dr. Benoit Lefevre	Okay. So can we go back to perhaps to slide 34 that will help?
Female Speaker 1	Yes one moment please I'll scroll it back.
Dr. Benoit Lefevre	Okay. Tell me it's difficult. If it's not possible I can just reply that. Difficult? Possible.
Female Speaker 1	There you go. You should be good to go.
Dr. Benoit Lefevre	Okay great, thanks. So basically the idea is that there are funds, there is carbon market and there is what we call emerging instrument. So the current funds, there is multilateral and bilateral funds that exist. You have a good—this is the main multilateral and bilateral funds. So international climate initiative, for example this is German 1 so there is some money coming from the Japan's Fast Start Funding Initiative and all these fund that are presented in this table are say have dedicated windows to the transport sectors. After that I cannot find every component of a transport system. So some are more oriented on technology issues and are more on planning issue, on mass printing issue, et cetera. So for example it's a clean technology funds of CTF is clearly oriented on keen technology. After that, you have the carbon market so there is created, that old, old to seek on carbon credit so you have this CDM. It's a clean development

mechanist instrument but you have all sources of voluntary markets, voluntary common credit market. Most are very, raised a lot of expectation of the transport sector and a lot of but ended to be quite disappointing. The transport sector is facing the letters of difficulty accessing, funding and mainly to what we call the monitoring, reporting and verification process here and that's what's right though we have a lot of opt to what we call the NAMA, so the Nationally Appropriate Mitigation Action that are starting to be submitted. The transport is a sector that had submitted the most NAMA until now. Money is coming to the starting to flow and to support implementation and design of those NAMA and there is different sources that can support that. For example there is a NAMA facility that has been created by the British and the German if you can find on the website also key element and currently there is a called open for submission so it's a good time to inform then we'll have a new one within six months. There is also four examples Partnership for Market Readiness of the world bank that is supporting NAMA development so there is many different funds like that.

Sean   Thank you Benoit. The next question is kind of a cute part question so let me read it through. If you need me to repeat it, I'll be more than happy to and the question is, what is the lead time for implementing a typical sustainable Low-Carbon Transport Project or Initiative in developing countries and then can you discuss the specific example in a developing country with targets in progress towards achievements?

Dr. Benoit Lefevre   Okay. So my answer to that will be first, it's important to not discuss only a project by project. We have a project by project approach here. Clearly my main message and it's valid for the planning and the financing part of this discussion is that what is the key is how you package suits. So it's not so much how you design a metro, a bike lane, bus rapid transits or how you design a car sharing system, et cetera. This is the key, this is complex, this is important but the main relevance is how you will package those different project and how you will integrate them and how you will integrate between the different component, the different mode and different component of the transport program, transport policy to having really a [inaudible] [00:49:44] and how you combine that with a cross-sectoral approach with also the sectors not only transport so I was taking the example of the land use planning because that's the most important terms and key one but there is also a sector that is a willing sector is very important to why sectors and its relation with the transport sector are very, very important. So, again and this is the same situation for the financing part. So it's really, have a packaging, that's the key thing and after that discretion of time of course is very important. This is one of the key issue and this is a key criteria for the decision making because that's also key for mayors for submission of elected body and how to be reelected. I mean when you build something, how people see you will decline and you will not be very popular during sub building phase but when you start, when the operation of your infrastructure starts, that's the moment where people really appreciate and see how efficient or relevant your policy was and

that was for example a key criteria of decision for the bus rapid transits in Bogota. To plan for example Mayor Peñalosa, when he decided to do the TransMilenio in Bogota, he decided to do a bus rapid transit. He didn't want to find the right solution then restart to have many study, et cetera. He knew that he wanted to do that so he decided, he has his consultant team, he has his own team just to design, implement and do that and he took 18 months. So that 18 months was like a key, was really a relevant account. I mean his mandate is three years so of course the timing was very important for him and that helped also process because he was able to manage the process from the beginning to the end. He was able also to transfer a good lesson and success of the first phase of the TransMilenio to its successor et cetera and so to ensure that there is a sort of continuity. So, but again let's—we can't—I mean timing is very important but packaging is really the key.

| Sean | Thank you Benoit and the next question is what are some of the key activity that donors are more keen to finance under Sustainable Low-Carbon Transport Sector? |

Dr. Benoit Lefevre   Key activity, that's a nice question. I mean I think that study again is not one type of technology or one type of policy, it's like—is it relevant? Is it well packaged and adapted to some local issue and to the context? Does it make sense? Is it align with some national and local long-term prospective? Is there enough political support, et cetera? So, yeah I don't think that it's one thing or another. Again it's—and that's really becoming something key everywhere is that we need to have a current package integrated set of policy and instruments. So it's not only financing or funding, investing in keen technology for example. We know that it will not be as you've opened it and it won't change anything. You can have a clean congestion, won't save, won't work, and won't help. So it's really a package of relevant policy that makes sense and for example you should take the discussion that happened in Brazil because of some different demonstrations and riot that happened and mainly because – partly because of the issue around its transport system and the fare was increasing et cetera. At times the discussion is coming back. It's not just reducing the facts, not just having more busses. It's really having a more efficient access to some relevant urban externalities. So having access to the job, having access to education, having access to the place where you want to go and that can be done not only with one element but need to be satisfied through a current set of action. That would be my answer.

Sean   Very good and then the next question from the audience is can the funds also be used for sustainable transport infrastructure implementation or they're only for study?

Dr. Benoit Lefevre   Sorry can you repeat the beginning so I can hear you?

Sean   Can the funds be used for sustainable transport infrastructure implementation or they're only for study?

Dr. Benoit Lefevre   No, in fact we are lacking and that's the big issue I think. We are lacking of financial sources for extreme work for study. In fact, most of the funds and most of the available money is for doing, implementing, and building which is relevant that often it's difficult to finance, to find all the extreme works of different institutional coordination to preparation of a good policy, good program. I will take one example here. And so again I will take a Mexican example but there is a similar story in India. So Mexico decided to have a national program of investments in Mass Rapid Transit System. It's available for all cities and in fact they spent more than two years designing, helping building the capacity in different cities to receive this money to plan to have a concrete plan that really makes the best use of this money once they will receive it and it was very difficult for them to finance this initial, this ex-ante work, this ex-ante capacity building, this ex-ante preparation and this is really one thing why I think that a less Low Emission Development Strategy Global Partnership is very, very useful because this is through LEDS Global Partnership. We are able to provide that kind of support. It is a little place but we are able to provide this report and that can really bring a lot of changes because often this report is not available. The good thing with LEDSGP is that we are also available to deliver this report to peer-to-peer learning which make much more sense for decision making, national and local decision makers and we've helped and quick to adaptation of good practice and good lessons, failures, also good failures in each country and to take into account the country's specificity here.

Sean   Alright and the next question Benoit from the audience is that the quality of the data and that information is crucial for designing sustainable transport projects? Now the availability of such data might be an issue especially in developing countries? How intensive in terms of financing and time or activities on gathering and estimating that data?

Dr. Benoit Lefevre   This is a very good question. This is a very important question. Quality, availability, and accessibility I would say because sometimes you can have available data but you cannot access those data or they are not shared between the institutions. They are not shared between actors, private and public actors. They are not shared between university and to big decision makers, et cetera. So having that kind of social access of data is very, very important. Answering this question is quite difficult. It depends on a lot of each country and so it's—I mean three different sides. My two sense here will be, first it's much more relevant and easier to create, collect and share data when the subdata will be not only for climate purpose but when subdata will be for climate purpose plus also purpose like planning, like addressing all the local co-benefit, national, external issue, et cetera. When the subdata that we need for climate are relevant for also decision making processes that makes him much more interesting to gather and here you have a synergy and a good snowball effect. My second point here will be to—there is also example of observatories that can be national or local that can be only for transport of urban issues et cetera but that's also and that can be a formal one institution or across institution, across administration

	institution. So there is different way to build, to establish an observatory that is a very good example showing that that kind of idea makes sense and health and support to policy making in a different level first and the coordination between the institutions.
Sean	Alright, thank you Benoit. That is all the questions that I have received from the attendees at this point. I do want to remind everyone that the presentation and the audio of the presentation will be posted now. The audio will be posted within the next week or two at cleanenergysolutions .org and then you navigate to the training page and it can be found under there. Benoit I'd like to just give you a chance for any closing remarks.
Dr. Benoit Lefevre	Just to first to thanks those who listened to this presentation. It was a pleasure to be part to do it. I would like also to thank the Clean Energy Solutions Center for hosting this webinar and I like that this is the first webinar of this area of webinar who would have series of webinar so go to Clean Energy Solution website, also LEDS and I think that we also have a mailing list so you can have more information in that. Thanks.
Sean	Alright and thank you again Benoit. Now, I just like to ask the audience to take a quick minute to answer a survey on the webinar you viewed today and we have five short questions for you to answer. Your feedback is very important to us and allows us to know what we are doing well and where we can improve. Heather can you display the first question please?
Sean	Alright, thank you and the next question? And then the final question? Alright, thank you for answering our survey and on behalf of the Clean Energy Solutions Center, I'd like to extend our hearty thank you to our expert panelist and to our attendees who participated in today's webinar. We've got a great audience today and we're very appreciative of your time. I invite our attendees once again to check the Solutions Center website over the next few weeks if you would like to view the slide and listen to a recording of today's presentation as well as any of the previously held webinars. Additionally, you'll find information on the upcoming webinars and other training events. We also invite you to inform your colleague and those in your networks about the Solution Center Resources and Services including the No Cost Policy Support. Hope everyone has a great rest of your day and we hope to see you again in the future Clean Energy Solutions Center event and this concludes our webinar.